

OPTIONS APPRAISAL

New Elgin Primary School is currently full, with very few spaces for incoming families. Even higher pupil numbers are expected to be living in the catchment area for the school in the next school year, 2016/17, with the total number of in-zone pupils expected to exceed the school's capacity even with the use of increased class sizes in P2 and P3. The school site is very tight and the Council would like to try and keep the maximum amount of play space around the school.

Given that the Council cannot provide a new school for south-east Elgin in the new zone until 2018 at the earliest, a solution needs to be found before the enrolments for primaries in January 2016.

Options are:

- A. Provide additional accommodation on site at New Elgin Primary School, including increased dining and PE facilities
- B. Provide modular accommodation at Greenwards Primary School for pupils from New Elgin Primary School.
- C. Review the accommodation at East End Primary School (Heritage Centre). (The recommended option.)
- D. Provide accommodation for P7s at Elgin High School.

All options have drawbacks and none are cost free, but there is urgency to finding a solution.

It should be noted that all timescales and costs identified are high level and a more detailed cost/timescale quotation should be obtained on any preferred option before implementing a proposal. In addition, the design team should be consulted to comment on likely building control compliance of any option.

OPTION 1 – PROVIDE ADDITIONAL ACCOMMODATION AT NEW ELGIN PRIMARY

Accommodation Cost

Additional accommodation would comprise a dining hall, equivalent in size to the current hall and a PE hall. High level estimates of cost for building are £2500/m², which results in:

New dining hall = 150.7m² at £2500/m² = £376,750

New PE hall = 150.7m² at £2500/m² = £376,750

Estimated cost = £753,500

These costs are based on a traditional build, as although modular accommodation would be cheaper for structures this large it would not be as substantial. The estimated timeframe from the design brief being available to being on site is 1 year.

It should be noted that it has not been investigated where this additional accommodation could be sited and any new accommodation would obviously have a detrimental impact on the current external space available at the school. In addition, this would add to the existing traffic issues that exist at the school.

ICT Costs

Based on guidance, a new hall would require 5 dual network points and 1 Wi-Fi point:

5* £600 = £3000

1* £300 = £300

A new PE block would require 4 dual network points and 1 Wi-Fi point:

4* £600 = £2400

1* £300 = £300

Total ICT Cost = £6000

This does not include additional power that would be required and is an estimate as prices depend on the length of cable runs required. In addition, depending on where the new network points are in relation to the current network cabinet a new network cabinet and fibre connection between the cabinets may be required which would cost £1000 - £2000.

Furniture Costs

Dining furniture to seat an additional 150 pupils:

Folding dining tables (8 seater tables) = 19 * £584 = £11,096

Catering Impacts

If the roll was to increase there would not be sufficient capacity within the kitchen facilities and therefore these would require to be expanded in addition to the extra facilities quoted above. The number of catering staff would also need to be increased to deal with the additional pupil numbers.

Transport Issues

There are a number of pedestrian routes into the school with only one vehicle entrance. Current issues are due to the congestion of the road network outside the school caused by only one road access, significant residential parking around the school, a single road access for the 50+ properties and a high number of children being driven to school. If the number of pupils was to increase this would compound the current issues. The transportation section is currently investigating options for improving the situation although it is unlikely any significant improvements could be implemented before August 2016.

OPTION 2 – PROVIDE MODULAR ACCOMMODATION AT GREENWARDS PRIMARY SCHOOL

Accommodation Costs

This option would provide 4 additional modular classrooms that could be used by P6/7 pupils from New Elgin Primary. The pupils would maintain their existing school identity whilst sharing facilities at Greenwards e.g. dining, PE. High level cost estimates for modular accommodation, based on the Millbank Primary refurbishment, would be as follows:

4 modular classrooms

$4 * 67m^2 * £1650/m^2 = £442,200$ (assumes no additional toilets required)

If toilets are to be provided so that the modular classrooms can be used as 'standalone' accommodation, the high level cost estimate, based on St Gerardine Primary School's refurbishment, would result in:

4 modular classrooms with toilet facilities and GP space incorporated
 $2 * 161m^2 * £1925m^2 = £619,850$ (this would provide 4 toilets)

Both prices include the cost for the foundation base, but do not include the building warrant or property design fees.

There are two separate estimated timescales for the above, one for long term use and one for temporary hire. These are as follows:

a) Buying Modular Accommodation for Long Term use

In total this would be 10 months from receipt of the full client brief until handover. The breakdown of timescales is , approximately 4 months for design/ tender/ statutory consent, 5 months from acceptance to delivery on site, 1 month for fit out and handover.

b) Temporary Hire of Modular Accommodation

In total this would be 6 months from receipt of the full client brief until handover. The breakdown of timescales is, 2 months for tender and contract award, 3 months for the foundations design with associated Building Warrant approval and, 1 month for delivery to site.

It should be noted that these timescales are also based on the use of similar design of modular accommodation as that currently being used on the 4 schools project.

ICT Costs

Based on guidance, a classroom would require 6 dual network points, 1 interactive whiteboard and 1 Wi-Fi point:

$6 * £600 = £3600$

$1 * £2417 = £2417$

$1 * £300 = £300$

Total per classroom = £6317

Total for 4 classrooms = $4 * £6317 = £25,268$

A GP space would require 5 dual network points, 1 interactive whiteboard and 1 Wi-Fi point:

5* £600 = £3000

1* £2417 = £2417

1* £300 = £300

Total = 5,717

Total ICT Cost = £30,985

This does not include additional power that would be required and is an estimate as prices depend on the length of cable runs required. In addition, depending on where the new network points are in relation to the current cabinet a new network cabinet and fibre connection between the cabinets may be required which would cost £1000 - £2000.

Furniture Costs

Based on standard fit out:

Classroom – 4 * £4,000 = £16000

GP space – 1 * £4,000 = £4,000

Total Furniture cost = £20,000

Catering Impacts

The dining area within Greenwards Primary is a corridor which is at capacity, however there is a hall that could be used, but until now the school has not made this area available at lunchtime. There would be a requirement for additional catering staff to deal with the additional pupil numbers.

Transport Impacts

There are already good walking networks to Greenwards and there is a service bus that operates in the area that could be used by pupils. However, this could potentially require an additional road crossing to be installed, with an estimated cost of £30,000 and a timescale of 12 months to implement.

Alternatively, pupils could be bussed from New Elgin to Greenwards with the cost of a 70 seater bus estimated at £180 a day (circa £34,000 a year), if this was to be a dedicated resource.

There is potential that this bus service could join a current contract but the nearest high capacity coaches are at Lossiemouth and in order for these to fulfil their current contractual arrangements the school drop off/pick up times would negatively affect the school teaching day. However, it is estimated this option would cost in the region of £80 a day (circa £15,000 a year).

OPTION 3 – ESTABLISH TEMPORARY SITE FOR THE NEW SOUTH-EAST ELGIN PRIMARY SCHOOL AT EAST END (HERITAGE CENTRE)

Accommodation Costs

This option would allow the current Heritage Centre building space to be converted into a 'stand-alone' school which could potentially accommodate the intake for the 'new school zoned pupils' until P3 when it is anticipated that the new school would be available at its permanent site.

The estimated cost to convert the current space into 4 classrooms, 1 GP space, toilets, a staff room with toilet and a new entrance extension (to include a small office) is:

Classrooms etc. = £400,000
Toilets = £40,000
New Entrance extension = £97,500
Building Warrant fees = £3,000
Property design fees = £53,700
Total = £594,200

This allows for full internal refurbishment including minor partition layout changes, heating distribution alterations, new power and lighting throughout, replacement internal doors, new floor coverings, new suspended ceilings and complete redecoration. The new entrance extension would be a flat roof construction within the recess, with a new reception desk arrangement.

Timescales to carry out the above work are a minimum of five months with vacant possession.

ICT Costs

Based on guidance, a classroom would require 6 dual network points, 1 interactive whiteboard and 1 Wi-Fi point:

6* £600 = £3600
1* £2417 = £2417
1* £300 = £300
Total per classroom = £6317
Total for 4 classrooms = 4 * £6317 = £25,268

A GP space would require 5 dual network points, 1 interactive whiteboard and 1 Wi-Fi point:

5* £600 = £3000
1* £2417 = £2417
1* £300 = £300
Total = 5,717

Staffroom would require 2 dual network points and a Wi-Fi point:

2*£600 = £1,200
1*£300 = £300
Total = £1,500

Reception area would potentially require 2 dual network points and a Wi-Fi point:

2*£600 = £1,200

1*£300 = £300

Total = £1,500

Head teacher's Office would require 2 dual network points and a Wi-Fi point:

2*£600 = £1,200

1*£300 = £300

Total = £1,500

Total ICT Cost = £35,485

This does not include additional power that would be required and is an estimate as prices depend on the length of cable runs required. In addition, depending on where the new network points are in relation to the current cabinet a new network cabinet and fibre connection between the cabinets may be needed which would cost £1000 - £2000.

Furniture Costs

Based on standard fit out:

Classroom – 4 * £4,000 = £16,000

GP space – 1 * £4,000 = £4,000

Reception – 1 * £1,500 = £1,500

Head Teacher Office – 1 * £1,800 = £1,800

Staff Room – 1 * £1500 = £1,500

Total Furniture Cost = £24,800

Catering Impacts

There are two options: either the pupils would use the current facilities where there is capacity in the halls next to the corridor the pupils currently eat in, or the gym hall could be used for lunch with a servery provided. The second option would have to be confirmed with the school to ensure that there was sufficient storage space for dining tables and that the flooring would be compatible with a change of use.

There would be a requirement for additional catering staff to deal with the additional pupil numbers.

Transport Impacts

There are already traffic issues due to the school being situated near the end of a cul de sac, on a narrow road with narrow footways. There has recently been a rise in the number of children being driven to school which increases the congestion at the school entrance. An increase in pupil numbers could potentially compound this issue.

Transportation are reviewing a number of options, including creating a new walking route from the Pinefield area which would benefit both the school children and the wider community by keeping people away from the A96; and creating a traffic-free zone at the end of Institution Road (with access for Andersons Care Home and residents) with a bus stop on Queen Street. Whilst minor improvements and the

bus stop could be implemented by August 2016, any significant improvements would rely upon the new walking route which is a longer term aspiration.

The bus stop would allow pupils to be bussed from the New Elgin area to East End until the new school was open. The estimated cost of a 70 seater bus is £180 a day (circa £34,000 a year), if this was a dedicated resource.

OPTION 4 - PROVIDE ACCOMMODATION FOR P7 PUPILS AT ELGIN HIGH SCHOOL

This option would require a dedicated space to be provided within Elgin High School to accommodate the P7 pupils from New Elgin Primary. The pupils would maintain their existing school identity whilst sharing facilities at the High School. In order to achieve this option a number of practical considerations would require to be overcome:

- Relocation of departments to free up accommodation
- Different approach to timetabling
- Separate toilet facilities provided
- Building security would require to be reviewed
- Separate social facilities both internal and external
- Access to ICT (different access for primary and secondary pupils)
- Clear protocols for the management of the building

The cost of providing the above would have to be considered within the context that this school is due to be demolished and therefore any money spent to provide a solution would not have a long term benefit. Some of the current pressures on the school would be exacerbated e.g. the lack of toilet facilities and social spaces; and any of the above changes could have a negative impact on the educational experience of both primary and secondary pupils. In addition, the forecast increased school roll for Elgin High School may cause issues if this was to be a longer term solution, as the High School would not have capacity for both secondary and primary pupils.

Catering Impacts

Staggered lunchtimes would have to be provided to maintain separation between primary and secondary pupils.

Transportation Issues

As per option 2 above.