

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC TUITION IN SCOTLAND

A REPORT BY THE SCOTTISH GOVERNMENT'S
INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP

June 2013



INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

FOREWORD BY THE CHAIR OF THE GROUP, DAVID GREEN

“Ag ionnsachadh og, ag ionnsachadh boidheach”
(Youthful learning is beautiful learning – in Gaelic)

“Music rightly is the best mind trainer.”
(Dr. Charles Eliot, former president of Harvard University)

“Music maks sense tae awbodie and o awbodie”
(Scots expression)

It was indeed a great privilege just before last Christmas to be asked by Dr Alasdair Allan MSP Minister for Learning, Science and Scotland’s languages to Chair a short-life Instrumental Music Group.

I reflected on this briefly by climbing Stac Pollaidh, in Wester Ross, contemplating how much the landscape and culture were in my DNA, and how this underpinned my life’s experiences and made me ready to accept this big and exciting challenge. Nostalgic thoughts re-awakened the sheer joy that being the father of four young pipers brought. Each step on the descent, overlooking the islands, reminded me of the many heart rending ceilidhs, performances and camaraderie as our children grew in confidence and self-esteem through School, Pipe Band and Feisean¹. Working with the Group has totally reinforced my belief in the truly amazing power of music, and my view that all parents and youngsters in Scotland should have a similar fantastic opportunity.

The approach of the Group was to have as our premise that it would be in Scotland’s interests that every child should have the opportunity to learn and enjoy playing a musical instrument; and indeed that no child should be disadvantaged from doing so as part of their broad general education. The Group wanted to ensure that all discussions around the remit were to be as inclusive as possible, albeit within the very short timescale set by Scottish Government.

My personal aspiration was to work up and build a consensual momentum from the Group towards the Final Report, at the same time as ensuring that the evidence and conclusions of this Report would lay a firm, though flexible, foundation for continuing post Report momentum. It is fundamental to my approach that all those who had given up their time and expertise to contribute to the Group’s deliberations would want to feel they owned part or hopefully all, of this Report. This should ensure that

¹ Fèis in Scottish Gaelic means “festival” or “feast.” Over the past three decades, the word Fèis has become synonymous with the Fèisean movement (Fèisean is the plural of Fèis). It has come to mean a tuition festival, usually for children and young people, which celebrates the music and song culture connected with the Gaelic language

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

the recommendations in this report aimed at improving access and opportunities will have a groundswell of support since our youngsters deserve nothing less.

The Group quickly appreciated and wanted to put on record that Scotland's core music education as complemented by the Youth Music Initiative and Instrumental Music Tuition - in spite of all the financial and other challenges - is a tremendous success story. Local Authorities, community groups, national organisations and many others, including of course our teachers, parents and youngsters can rightly be proud of this achievement. While there is always room for improvement, there is a growing body of evidence and many anecdotes that confirm this success.

I believe there is now a real opportunity to build on this success. We can capture learning from inside and outside Scotland at the same time as enjoying, and supporting our musical heritage while it continues to enrich our culture bringing many social, economic and cultural benefits.

With less than five months to investigate the remit there is clearly more work to be done on this big and fascinating subject. Music education generally is an important gateway to lifelong learning, and in turn pays many dividends back to Scotland now, as well as into the future. I will look forward to Instrumental Music Tuition playing a significant role in that future.

I want to thank all of the Group for their much valued contribution. Chairing this Group has been a real pleasure. The Group's strategic and hands on experience, all underpinned with an infectious enthusiasm, has helped shape this Report's integrity as well as its consensual and constructive style. I would also like to thank the strong professional support of the Scottish Government Secretariat and their Adviser. Finally, I would like to thank all Local Authorities and the Local Government Improvement Service as well as the many consultees for their input and assistance.

David Green, OBE
Achnahaird, Achiltibuie, Wester Ross.



INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

FACAIL-TOISICH BHO CHATHRAICHE NA BUIDHNE, DAIBHIDH GREEN

“An t-ionnsachadh òg, an t-ionnsachadh bòidheach”
(Youthful learning, beautiful learning)

“Music rightly is the best mind trainer.”
(An Dr. Teàrlach Eloit, a bha na cheann-suidhe air Oilthigh Harvard)

“Music maks sense tae awbodie and o awbodie”
(Abairt Albais)

Dhà-riribh 's e fìor urram a bha ann ro àm Nollaig an-uiridh an uair a dh'fhaighneachd an Dr Alasdair Allan, am Ministear airson Ionnsachadh, Saidheans agus Cànan na h-Alba, dhomh an tiginn nam Cathraiche den Bhuidhinn Cèol Innsramaideach.

Fhad 's a bha mi a' sreap Stac Pollaidh, air Taobh Siar Rois, smaoinich mi air mar a bha an àrainneachd agus ar cultar stèidhichte na mo DNA agus an lùib a h-uile sian a rinn mi fad mo bheatha. 'S ann air sàillibh seo a bha cinnteach gu robh mi deiseil airson an dùbhlàn inntinneach seo. A' coimhead air ais, chuimhnich mi air an toileachas agus an sòlas a thug e dhomh a bhith nam phàrant le ceithir pìobairean. Gach ceum, a' coimhead sìos air na h-eileanan gu h-ìosal, chuimhnich mi air na cèilidhean mìorbhaileach thar nam bliadhnaichean agus an càirdeas a bha nam measg agus am fèin-mhìsneachd a fhuair a' chlann tron Sgoil, Còmhlan-ciùil Phìobaireachd agus Fèisean. Tha buannachdan iongantach fhèin math an sàs ann an cèol agus 's e mo bheachd-sa gum bu chòir cothroman ciùil a bhith ann do phàrantan agus òigridh air feadh Alba. Tha m'obair leis a' Bhuidhinn seo air a' bheachd seo a neartachadh gu mòr.

'B e tùs-bheachd na Buidhne gum biodh e buannachdail do dh'Alba nam biodh cothroman rim faotainn airson gach sgoilear ionnsramaide ciùil ionnsachadh; agus gu dearbh gum bu chòir an cothrom seo a bhith aca mar phàirt de dh'fhoghlam san fharsaigeachd. Bha a' Bhuidheann airson dèanamh cinnteach gum biodh deasbad ann cho farsaing sa ghabhadh air a' chuspair seo, ged nach robh clàr-ama Riaghaltas na h-Alba ach teann.

'B e mo mhiann fhèin taic agus aonta fhaighinn bhon Bhuidhinn airson an Aithisg Dheireannach, ach aig a' cheart àm gum bithinn cinnteach gum biodh fianais agus co-dhùnaidhean bhon Aithisg seasmhach agus sùbailte gu leòr airson nach stad an t-adhartas cho luath 's a thèid an Aithisg fhoillseachadh. Bha e deatamach gu robh gach duine a thug seachad ùine agus ealantas a' faireachdainn gu do chuidich iad leis an Aithisg. Bu chòir seo dèanamh cinnteach gum biodh taic ann airson nam molaidhean anns an Aithisg, a tha ag amas air cothroman a chruthachadh airson òigridh na dùthcha. 'S iad a tha airidh air.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Bha a' Bhuidheann mothachail agus ag iarraidh soilleireachadh gu bheil cèol aig cridhe an fhoghlaim ann an suidheachadh fallain a dh'aindeoin gach dùbhlann ionmhais. Tha an suidheachadh seo air a dhearbhadh bhon Iomairt Cèol Òigridh agus Ionnsramaideach. Bu chòir ùghdarrasan ionadail, buidhnean ionadail, buidhnean nàiseanta agus eile, tidsearan, pàrantan agus òigridh nam measg, a bhith moiteil mun seo. Ged a tha sinn a' an-còmhnaidh a' stri airson piseach, tha fianas gu leòr ann a' dearbhadh cho soirbheachail 's a tha e.

Tha mi fhèin den bheachd gu bheil cothrom ann a-nis togail air a seo. Dh'fhaodar dòighean ionnsachaidh a thogail bho taobh a-muigh agus am broinn Alba agus aig an aon àm toileachas fhaighinn bho ar cèol agus taic a chur ris, gu h-àraid fhad 's a tha e a' toirt dhuinn buannachdan sòisealta, eaconamach agus culturail.

Le nas lugha na còig mìosan airson sgrùdadh air na h-amasan, gu deimhinne tha barrachd obair ri dhèanamh air a' phròiseact inntinneach seo. San fhàrsaingeachd, tha foghlam cèol na shlighe cudromach do ionnsachadh fad bheatha, agus mar sin, bheir e mòran air ais do dh'Alba san latha an-diugh agus san àm ri teachd. Nach e bhios math an uair a bhios Teagaisg Cèol na phàirt deatamach dhan seo.

Bu mhath leam mo thaing a thoirt dhan Bhuidhinn airson gach cuideachadh a thug iad dhomh. Bha e air leth tlachdmhòr a bhith nam Chathraiche. Bha eòlas ro-innleachdail, agus practaigeach, a bharrachd air dòigh obrach èasgaidh aig a' Bhuidhinn air fad. Chuidich seo an Aithisg a dhealbh ann an dòigh cuideachail agus feumail. Tha mi cuideachd airson mo thaing a thoirt do Chlàireachais Riaghaltas na h-Alba airson an cuideachadh mìorbhaileach. Mu dheireadh, mòran taing do na h-Ùghdarrasan Ionadail uile agus Seirbheisean Leasachaidh agus bhur luchd-obrach airson na rinn sibh.

Daibhidh Green, OBE
Achnahaird, Achd Ille Bhuidhe, Taobh Siar Rois.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Introduction to the Instrumental Music Group

In 2012 it became evident that pressures were building on Local Authorities' music services in terms of rising demands for instrumental music tuition within shrinking education and culture budgets resulting from the economic situation. Instrumental music services have endured similar challenges in the past but the general feeling was that this time, the scale and nature of the challenges faced were of a different scale altogether.

At the same time concerns were also raised by musicians, parents, Members of the Scottish Parliament and the media about the increasing incidence of charging for instrumental music tuition, including such tuition associated with Scottish Qualifications Authority (SQA) qualifications. On 28th November 2012, there was a members' debate in the Scottish Parliament on the Value of Instrumental Music Tuition instigated by Iain Gray MSP². During this debate the Minister for Learning, Science and Scotland's Languages, Dr Alasdair Allan MSP committed the Scottish Government to working with Local Authorities and COSLA "to find a way forward on this matter and to helping address the issue of instrumental music tuition in schools".

On 16 December 2012 the Scottish Government announced³ the formation of an Instrumental Music Group to examine the issues surrounding the provision of Instrumental Music Tuition and provide a report.

David Green⁴ was asked by Ministers to be the independent Chairman of the Instrumental Music Group with the following Remit:-

- To investigate the circumstances and practices of Local Authorities' provision and policies for instrumental music tuition services and in particular, the practice of Local Authorities' charging for such provision for pupils taking SQA exams as well as charging for instrumental music tuition in general.
- To consider the options for the delivery of instrumental music tuition through the use of community resources both in and out of school;

and in light of this:-

- To provide recommendations to ensure greater clarity, transparency and fairness of Local Authority instrumental music tuition practices and the continued uptake and enjoyment of instrumental music opportunities in schools, irrespective of a young persons' background or location.

² <http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/parliamentarybusiness/28862.aspx?r=7964>

³ <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/News/Releases/2012/12/moneyformusic16122012>

⁴ Former Independent Convenor of Highland Council; Former chair of Cairngorms National Park Authority and Crofters Commission; Member of The Scotland Committee of The Big Lottery Fund; Non-Executive director of SAC Commercial Ltd (part of Scottish Rural University College); self-employed crofter.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The Chair was asked to provide a report to Ministers by 30 June 2013. The Report contains 17 Recommendations and these are listed in full on page 28.

Membership of the Group is listed at Annex A.

Membership was drawn from key stakeholders in Scotland, including Education Scotland, Local Authorities, Music Teachers (School; Instrumental and Higher Education), Unions, Parents and Community Groups involved in music.

The Group met 5 times between 31 January and 23 May 2013 in 5 cities (Edinburgh; Aberdeen; Glasgow; Inverness and Perth) around Scotland.

Details of the meetings and the work of the Group is available on the Scottish Government website at:-

<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Education/Schools/curriculum/ACE/InstrumentalMusicGroup>



INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

BACKGROUND TO AND SCOPE OF THE REPORT

Music in all its forms plays a huge role in Scotland's culture and life. In our schools, music education - including learning to play a musical instrument - provides enormous benefits for young people in terms of their cognitive development as well as very significant cultural and economic benefits to society as a whole. In schools, music education and particularly instrumental music learning and teaching is a subject that provokes strong emotions.

The remit of the Instrumental Music Group is to consider Local Authority instrumental music tuition services. This report therefore concerns Instrumental Music_(including vocal) Tuition (hereafter referred to as **Instrumental Music Tuition**) delivered by Local Authorities' Instrumental Music Services.

The report does **not** concern **Music Education** as a class subject (delivered by music teachers in classrooms) or the **Youth Music Initiative** (YMI) – although it is often difficult to isolate one of these forms of music learning and teaching from the other. Clearly music education in classrooms and through YMI contribute to instrumental music tuition and vice versa.

Before focusing on instrumental music tuition, it is worth explaining briefly the contributions made by music education and the YMI.

In Scottish schools **Music Education** as a subject is part of the Expressive Arts curriculum area of Curriculum for Excellence. It is taught by GTCS⁵ registered teachers to young people from Primary 1 (median age 5) and throughout their broad general education phase of Curriculum for Excellence to Secondary 3 (median age 15). In the senior phase of school (ages 16-18), many pupils elect to take National (SQA) exams in music, which includes being able to demonstrate competence in two musical instruments. Students are also able to achieve recognition through taking external music examinations e.g. Associated Board (ABRSM), Trinity College, Rock School etc. and graded qualifications from any age choosing from a variety of different instruments / voice and in music theory.

The **Youth Music Initiative (YMI)** is a Scottish Government programme administered by Creative Scotland - the national agency for the arts, screen and creative industries. Since its establishment the YMI has been managed by the Scottish Arts Council then Creative Scotland and the Scottish Government has invested a total of £87.5 million over 10 years. The YMI currently operates with an annual budget of £10 million and supports in excess of 300 projects each year covering all musical genres, age groups and teaching methods. More information on YMI is at Annex B.

Instrumental music tuition is an additional and discretionary service, provided by Local Authorities. As a discretionary service, Local Authorities decide what and how to provide instrumental music tuition depending on local circumstances, priorities and traditions. All Local Authorities in Scotland provide young people with the

⁵ General Teaching Council for Scotland - <http://www.gtcs.org.uk/home/home.aspx>

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

opportunity to develop the skills of playing a musical instrument where resources allow. Instrumental music tuition is highly valued – by young people themselves, their parents and families - and there are many examples of excellent practice in terms of instrumental music delivery and the benefits both musically and educationally to young people. Learning to play a musical instrument also helps deliver Curriculum for Excellence with young musicians becoming successful in their learning as well as confident individuals, responsible citizens and effective contributors.

It is a tribute to Local Authorities that despite the current economic and financial constraints and challenges that they have all managed to sustain and in some cases grow the provision of the discretionary instrumental music services in their area. Local Authorities have developed many models to enable this delivery arising from their individual circumstances, and priorities.



Photo courtesy East Ayrshire Council: Joint Ayrshire Cello Day.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

CONTEXT OF SUCCESS

Music education - including instrumental music tuition and YMI - is a significant success story in our education system and is undoubtedly viewed as a 'success story' across the UK and abroad.. This is not often appreciated and is certainly not heralded. There is a wealth of young talent receiving a range of excellent opportunities across Scotland bringing huge cognitive, personal, societal, cultural and economic benefits to Scotland as a nation and its people. There is always room for improvement however and the Group's recommendations are designed to build on the current success and Scotland's position as a leading nation in this area.

There are many indicators of this success as the following paragraphs show:-

On **Music Education** data from SQA show that Music is currently the 12th most popular Higher exam in terms of presentation numbers and numbers presenting for Music Highers over the last 5 years have increased 14.3% from 4451 in 2008 to 5090 in 2012. At Advanced Higher, Music is the 6th most popular subject and presentations have increased 23.2% between 2008 and 2012 – from 1055 in 2008 to 1300 in 2012. Pass rates have also improved over the last 5 years; in 2008, 90% of candidates passed music at Higher and this improved to 94% in 2012. The comparable data for Advanced Highers is 93% pass rate in 2008, increasing to 96% in 2012. During this period the number of music teachers in Primary and Secondary have remained static at between 967 and 981. In 2000, Music was the 13th most popular Higher with 2748 candidates and in 1990, there were 1156 Higher candidates. This represents an increase in uptake of 85% in the 12 years between 2000 and 2012 and 340% in the 22 years between 1990 and 2012.

Through the **Youth Music Initiative (YMI)** all Scotland's primary school children now have access to one year's free music tuition. By the end of the academic year 2010/11 the total of attendances at YMI funded programmes has been at least 1.7 million (1,736,372) across all of Scotland's 32 local authority areas. Furthermore in the fifth year of the programme a total of 194.94 FTE staff (586 individuals) were employed by local authorities providing increased opportunities for participation in high quality music programmes. At May 2013 there have been 379 successful applications to the YMI informal sector grant fund and £5.9 million has been awarded with the total requests for funding reaching £13.0 million. A further £3.76 million in partnership funding has been levered of which, £2.37 million has been in cash contributions. There have been 1,019,042 attendances at Scottish Booktrust's Bookbug sessions since 2007 ensuring music is becoming a part of the everyday family life for toddlers and parents.

On **Instrumental Music Tuition** many Local Authority Services are very active, offering a large number of extra activities including music centres, bands, orchestras, ensembles and residential courses. Scottish Instrumental Music Services have consistently gained recognition by the National Music Council (NMC)⁶. In 2010, 48% of the UK awards presented went to Scottish Instrumental Music Services and in 2012 the NMC commented that "In many ways, Scotland has again shown us the way". The NMC recognises those authorities across the UK that are able to

⁶ www.nationalmusiccouncil.org.uk

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

demonstrate imaginative, inclusive and all round high quality music provision. One example is West Lothian Council. In 2003 the number of pupils receiving instrumental tuition was 1884; by 2013 that number had increased to 2339 - an increase of 455 or an increase of just over 24%. Over the same period Full Time Equivalent staff levels slightly decreased over that period. Across all of Scotland's Local Authorities, some 633.54 FTE instrumental music instructors / teachers are currently employed providing instrumental music lessons to over 55,000 pupils. Overall, the total financial contribution by parents into instrumental music tuition is estimated at around £3.8 million every year whilst the cost of Instrumental Music Services is over £27 million per year⁷.

These levels of commitment, investment and quality have wide ramifications, many of which (such as the contribution to a thriving and vibrant creative arts sector and economy) are outwith the remit of the Group. However one key outcome is the very high standards of musical achievement in Scotland by school pupils as demonstrated by the applications to study music at Conservatoires. Data published in the Conservatoires UK Admission System (CUKAS) Annual Report 2012⁸ shows that there are proportionately many more applications to UK Conservatoires from Scotland domiciled students than from any other part of the country. When compared to Greater London, over three times as many applications are received from students resident in Scotland.

The success of the position of music in Scotland has been commented on as follows:

Viewing Scotland's approach from Europe Martin Prchal⁹ comments:- "Scotland is clearly leading the way internationally in providing access for young people to music education. The impact of music education activities in the lives of young people cannot be underestimated: it supports their personal and artistic development, creates social cohesion and enhances learning skills in other education areas. The fact that Scotland is making this investment despite the global financial crisis is nothing less than remarkable".

Darren Henley¹⁰ remarked that "Schoolchildren in Scotland benefit from a rich and varied music education, with dedicated teachers delivering tuition to the highest standards in many parts of the country. It is to be applauded that Scottish young people are offered music education that centres around excellent provision alongside a structured route of progression from the very youngest musician through to those who have exceptional talent being taught at world renowned institutions, such as the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland".

⁷ Improvement Service research

⁸ <http://www.cukas.ac.uk/documents/annualreport11.pdf>

⁹ Vice-Principal Royal Conservatoire The Hague, former Chief Executive European Association of Conservatoires (AEC).

¹⁰ Managing Director, Classic FM.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Mike Cantlay¹¹ said: “Whether it’s a ceilidh in a local pub in the Highlands, or attending one of our magnificent open air mass music festivals, music runs deep through the authentic Scottish visitor experience. Next year we’ll be welcoming the world to celebrate our culture during the year of Homecoming Scotland 2014, with music playing a vital role in many of the events planned throughout the country. Our country is blessed with some fantastic musicians and songwriters, so I applaud any initiative to make sure that Scotland’s world famous welcome is accompanied by a strong beat of creativity.”

In terms of comparison with Europe, the provision of instrumental music services by Local Authorities across Scotland in its current model is also somewhat unique and envied by many other countries in Europe. European countries generally provide instrumental music services for young people out-with and after schools - in the afternoons, evenings and at weekends, sometimes for a fee¹². In contrast, the Scottish model that has built up is highly inclusive; Authorities provide instrumental tuition within schools through diverse delivery and funding models with opportunities for joining in bands and ensembles after school and/or at weekends, either free of charge or highly subsidised. This makes instrumental music part of a school’s life and ethos and part of the whole school experience and education system.

All of the above plays a significant part in instrumental music’s contribution to the Government’s overall purpose of sustainable economic growth as well as several of the national outcomes in the Government’s National Performance Framework – not least that our young people are successful learners, confident individuals, responsible citizens and effective contributors.



Photo acknowledgement: South Lanarkshire Instrumental Service

¹¹ Chairman of VisitScotland.

¹² More information on arrangements in Europe is at <http://www.polifonia-tn.org/content.aspx?id=2299>

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

THE INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP'S APPROACH

The Chair was clear from the outset that the Group was accountable to Ministers and would adopt an inclusive and consensual approach; and that despite the potential scope that such a study of instrumental music services could incorporate, that a short focused report should be the objective.

It was also made clear at the first meeting that the meetings would be held according to the Chatham House rule, and that candid open discussion about all the issues and challenges was necessary and encouraged. At the same time, it was felt important to follow the models of other Scottish Government Curriculum Working Groups (such as Scottish Studies, Languages and One Planet Schools) and publish details of the Group's membership, remit and minutes of meetings online¹³.

Bearing in mind the deadline set by the Government of a report by the end of June 2013, it was decided to hold five meetings (one per month) from January to May. The first meeting held in Edinburgh on 31 January endorsed the suggestion that further meetings should take place around Scotland – in Aberdeen, Glasgow, Inverness and Perth. Dates for the remaining four meetings were set in January and subsequent attendance by members was very high.

On January 7th 2013 the Minister for Learning, Science and Scotland's Languages Dr Alasdair Allan MSP wrote to prospective organisations inviting membership of the Group and nominees were submitted. In this way, members brought expertise, knowledge and also representation to the Group. They also committed to report back to their body and feed in views accordingly.

The Minister for Learning, Science and Scotland's Languages also met the Chair on January 18th and set out his aims for the Group.

After the first meeting on January 31st it was felt that the Group would benefit from two additional members – one from the private sector and one from a community music origin. Darren Henley, Managing Director of Classic FM and author of a report¹⁴ for the Department for Education into music education in England was approached and agreed to become a virtual member of the Group. For community interests, both the National Youth Orchestra of Scotland (NYOS) and the National Youth Choir of Scotland (NYCoS) were suggested as bodies representing community music and they shared attendance over the final three meetings in Glasgow, Inverness and Perth.

Hannah Derbyshire of the Improvement Service also attended the final three meetings to present and discuss their research findings and Bruce Robertson of ADES attended the final two meetings as Adviser to the Group.

¹³ <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Education/Schools/curriculum/ACE/InstrumentalMusicGroup>

¹⁴ <http://www.education.gov.uk/schools/teachingandlearning/curriculum/a00204067/henleyreview>

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Evidence

In terms of gathering information and evidence to support the Group's deliberations it was felt that the meetings around the country should be supplemented with additional evidence gathering discussions. Arrangements were made for the Chair and Secretariat (Scottish Government officials) to meet informally with local Community music Groups from the area where possible and also relevant Local Authorities (Education staff; Heads of Instrumental music services and relevant elected members) in Aberdeen, Glasgow, Inverness and Perth. These meetings enabled a clearer picture to emerge of the local arrangements for Community music groups and formal teaching of instrumental music. It also provided background to the rationale behind various approaches and details of charging policies. A list of these informal and formal meetings are at Annex C.

In addition, a narrative outlining the Group's work was drawn up and distributed by Group members to as many organizations and individuals as possible – inviting them to provide a written response to some standard questions. The Group is very grateful to all the organisations and individuals who took time to provide this valuable evidence. A list of all these contributions is also included in Annex C and the individual contributions (where authorised) are available on the Instrumental Music Group's website¹⁵. The Chair also met or spoke with a variety of music stakeholders to ascertain their perspectives on the issues remitted to the Group. The Chair was also keen to have a cross party input into the Group's deliberations and met with MSPs from the Labour, Conservative and Liberal Democrat political parties. A list of all the stakeholders approached is also included in Annex C.

Data

It soon became apparent that although some information about instrumental music services was available (notably from a short Scottish Government survey carried out in September 2012) there was no overview of the varied position across the country. Furthermore, it was also clear that without such information the Group would be severely hampered in coming to firm conclusions. It was therefore agreed that such information was essential and a small sub-group of members (Scottish Government; Association of Directors of Education in Scotland (ADES) and Heads of Instrumental Teaching in Scotland (HITS)) met to agree a set of detailed questions that all Local Authorities should be asked to enable a full picture of instrumental music provision to emerge.

The Local Government Improvement Service¹⁶ offered to gather, analyse and present this information. They consulted all 32 Local Authorities in Scotland and

¹⁵ <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Education/Schools/curriculum/ACE/InstrumentalMusicGroup>

¹⁶ The Improvement Service was set up in 2005 to help improve the efficiency, quality and accountability of local public services in Scotland by providing advice, consultancy and programme support to councils and their partners. – see <http://www.improvementservice.org.uk/the-improvement-service/>

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

gathered comprehensive data on instrumental music services, including information on charges and concessions; the costs of providing the service and revenues received; the numbers of pupils and teachers involved in instrumental music as well as selection processes and retention.

Full details of the research are provided as a separate Appendix to the report with the Executive Summary provided at Annex D. There are several key findings from this work, including:-

- There are wide variations between instrumental music policies in Local Authorities (as there are for musical traditions, cultures, demography and income). A policy that is successful in one Local Authority would not necessarily be optimal for another. Popularity and demand vary between and within Local Authorities, therefore, requiring a local focus;
- Overall, tuition charges are only one consideration regarding access to instrumental music tuition. Many other features such as range and number of instruments and instructors, and selection procedures and concessions also affect access to the service;
- No Local Authority in Scotland has a completely universal instrumental music service in the sense that any pupil can access tuition on any instrument. Nonetheless, there is no doubt about these services' commitment to provide optimal service given the resources available;
- All instrumental music services are substantially subsidised by Local Government (across the country charging currently funds almost 20% of the total budget for instrumental music tuition);
- Although some services try to accommodate all interested pupils, in many Local Authorities this is simply not possible as demand highly outweighs resources; and
- there is no systematic relationship between the take up rate of instrumental music tuition in terms of the percentage of pupils participating and whether a Council charges for this or not or the level of fee they charge.

More commentary on this research appears throughout the report.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Structure of the Report

During the Group's discussions, several themes emerged and these soon developed into potential recommendations. The report is based around six themes which are addressed in the remainder of the report in 6 Sections as follows:-

1. The value and benefits of Music education and instrumental music tuition;
2. Charging for instrumental music tuition;
3. Collaboration on and benefits to instrumental music with other Local Authorities, Community Groups, YMI and the more effective use of musical instruments;
4. New technologies;
5. The Instrumental music tuition workforce; and
6. Future work.



Photo acknowledgement: North Lanarkshire Instrumental Service

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Section 1. The value and benefits of music education and instrumental music tuition

There are many interesting and varied examples of the delivery of music education and instrumental music tuition around the world. Within the timescale available the Group did not have the opportunity to explore these in any detail and how the challenges of quality of tuition were affected by class sizes, week-end teaching, the potential use of music schools and hub arrangements; nor how examples of good practice with regard to music education and instrumental music tuition in Scotland and internationally could have the potential to be replicated.

Notwithstanding this the Group was well aware that there is much support for music education in Scotland and music has been part of the school curriculum for many years.

Music education in Scottish schools provide opportunities for children and young people to play on a minimum of two instruments including voice and to experience learning which is mainly practical and experiential. In addition (and as previously noted) the Government's Youth Music Initiative guarantees all young people in Scotland the opportunity to play a musical instrument by the time they conclude their Primary 6 year.

As children develop their musical interests and experiences, they are given additional opportunities to learn to play a musical instrument with tuition provided by the Local Authority instrumental music service. Depending on the instrument and Local Authority policies, this can start from Primary 4 and continue through to Secondary 6. This typically involves a young person leaving class for an individual or small group specialist tuition in another room. It is this specialist and small class learning environment, coupled with practice sessions at home, that develops instrumental music abilities.

There is a wide variety of instrumental music tuition provision across Scotland - in terms of the instruments available; the tuition charging regime and concessions; whether an instrument is provided free, for hire or at all; and the range of opportunities for Authority-wide group and ensemble experiences. Schools, particularly at secondary level have school bands, orchestras, ensembles and groups that perform a variety of concerts throughout the year at school, local community, national and international events. The average uptake of instrumental music tuition also varies across the country depending on the Local Authority - from 4.5% to 20%. The overall average proportion of pupils in Scotland receiving instrumental music tuition is estimated at 8.3%.¹⁷

It is the mix of music lessons in school (which all pupils will have through their broad general education), coupled with specific opportunities to learn a musical instrument out-with the classroom that makes music different to most other curriculum subjects.

¹⁷ Note that this percentage reflects the fact that in many places auditions for instrumental music tuition are necessary as demand for tuition exceeds the supply of supply of instructors / teachers.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The provision of instrumental music services is regarded as a discretionary service by Local Authorities. Notwithstanding this, all Local Authorities value highly the benefits of their instrumental music services and all currently provide instrumental music tuition to complement normal school music lessons. Indeed, the Group heard evidence from many quarters that there are widely and strongly held views about the provision of instrumental music tuition. Parents in some areas were very keen to ensure the continuation of such opportunities faced with threats of reductions and were prepared to start paying or pay more to ensure continuation of the services. This was for a variety of reasons, from the intrinsic cognitive value of such learning to the social and confidence boosting opportunities arising from group work¹⁸ (see also Bibliography – Annex E).

Learners playing a musical instrument can experience enjoyment and contribute to other people's enjoyment through creative and expressive performance and presentations. Within a rich, supportive environment teachers will draw upon a skillful mix of approaches to promote a climate of creativity and innovation, including:

- active involvement in creative activities and performances
- tasks or performance opportunities which require a creative response
- opportunities to perform or present to an audience
- partnerships with professional performers or artists and other creative adults
- raising awareness of contemporary culture and connecting with young people's experiences
- appropriate, effective use of technology
- building on the principles of Assessment is for Learning
- both collaborative and independent learning
- establishing links within the expressive arts subjects and with the wider curriculum
- opportunities to analyse, explore and reflect¹⁹.

Despite the many benefits of music learning in general and instrumental music tuition in particular and strong feelings and support for music by parents and pupils there is no National Vision for Music education including the distinctive part played by Instrumental Music Tuition in Scotland. This provides a challenge for those delivering a discretionary instrumental music service which adds considerable value to the curriculum.

Notwithstanding this and mindful of the huge benefits that instrumental music tuition can bring to all young people, the Group was concerned that some young people,

¹⁸ <http://www.plosone.org/article/info%3Adoi%2F10.1371%2Fjournal.pone.0003566#pone.0003566-Bangerter1>

¹⁹ See Curriculum for Excellence Expressive Arts resources - <http://www.educationscotland.gov.uk/learningteachingandassessment/curriculumareas/expressivearts/index.asp>

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

were not able to benefit from such opportunities for a variety of reasons, including their location and family circumstances.

The Group noted the limited and variable provision of instrumental music tuition available for pupils with Additional Support Needs as well as the huge value and life-changing impact that learning to play a musical instrumental can give to such children. Learning a musical instrument can empower children, be rewarding and motivating, improve communication skills, assist in the development of academic and speech goals and encourage enhanced social connections.

In light of the above, the Group makes the following Recommendations:-

Recommendation 1

Music Education, including the distinctive part played by Instrumental Music Tuition, would benefit from a National Vision Statement. This should be the subject of a collective approach linking formal and informal providers and which highlights the wider benefits of young people's participation in, and the learning of a musical instrument, including singing.

Recommendation 2

The provision of instrumental music services by all Local Authorities is unique highly valued and helps deliver Curriculum for Excellence. The Group recommends that Local Authorities should continue to deliver this service, notwithstanding the current financial challenges.

Recommendation 3

There should be a general principle that pupils' individual circumstances should not be a barrier to their ability to access and benefit from instrumental music tuition. Local Authorities should review their charging policies and concessionary schemes to ensure that pupils in their area are not prevented from learning a musical instrument because of their background, location, disability or financial circumstances. Local Authorities should be willing to share good practice on availability, access to and the transparency of their concession and charging policies including consultation on these matters.

Recommendation 4

Further to Recommendation 3, the Group noted the limited and variable provision of instrumental music tuition available for pupils with additional support needs as well as the huge value and life-changing impact that learning to play a musical instrumental can provide. The Group recommends that Local Authorities share best practice in their delivery of instrumental music tuition to all children and young people equally, including approaches to specialist training and continuing professional development for Instrumental staff to broaden out and extend provision, particularly to children with additional support needs.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Section 2. Charging for instrumental music tuition

Prior to the Group starting work in January 2013 it was known that 24 out of 32 Local Authorities charged some fees for the provision of instrumental music tuition and the Group was not asked to consider or comment on any legal questions around this policy.

In the early 1990s charging for instrumental music services was not common practice. At this time instrumental music services were part of the 9 Regional Councils and 3 Island Authorities and economies of scale in providing the service were pertinent. On local government reorganisation in 1996, the 9 mainland Regions became 29 mainland Local Authorities (with the 3 island Authorities maintaining unitary status). Since then there has been an increase in the incidence and scale of charges introduced for instrumental music tuition (see Improvement Service data.)

There has been unprecedented financial challenges facing Local Authorities over recent years and this has seen, inter alia, the introduction of and an increase in charging primarily to protect the discretionary instrumental music services. Local Authorities balance their own budgets and have the power to spend the discretionary parts of these budgets on local priorities.

As the financial pressures continue to build on Local Authorities to protect the provision of core services, it is likely that all additional and discretionary services - such as Instrumental Music Services - will come under renewed budget and indeed public scrutiny. Looking into this challenging future financial scenario, there needs to be a more considered approach to designing the instrumental music tuition discretionary service. Concessions and charges will need to protect disadvantaged youngsters at the same time as maximising access and opportunity for all youngsters. A service that is able to demonstrate in a transparent manner its continuing benefits will help underpin its own sustainability.

As at 1 June 2013, 24 of the 32 Local Authorities had a charging regime for instrumental music tuition in place, with 8 Local Authorities providing instrumental music tuition free (see Improvement Service data).

There is a very mixed picture across Local Authorities regarding approaches to the planning and delivery of instrumental music provision and charging and concessions available for the services provided. However no Local Authority makes a profit from its instrumental music services and overall charging currently funds almost 20% of the total budget for instrumental music tuition.

The evidence of the Improvement Service research shows that there is no systematic relationship between the take up rate of instrumental music tuition (in terms of the percentage of pupils participating) and whether a Council charges or not. Equally, no relationship was found between uptake and the level at which charges were set across Scotland. Some of the highest charging councils have better participation rates than councils that do not charge at all. There are a variety of factors that may explain variable participation in instrumental music tuition across Scotland including local cultures and traditions of music making, the degree to which participation is promoted, different approaches to aptitude testing and selection, etc.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

What the research shows is that charging, and the level of charges set, are not explanations of variable participation across Scotland.

This variety of provision has raised questions about why there is no uniform policy across the country. The Group understands the importance of flexibility for each Local Authority to decide on its policy in this area and recognises the principle that they should set policies for access, concessions and charging as they see fit and according to local demands and circumstances.

When taking a SQA National qualification in music students need to present evidence of their ability to play two musical instruments, which may include voice (singing). Some choose to present this practical aspect with instruments learned in music education lessons (voice; keyboard; guitar or percussion), but many others choose an instrument (or two) learned from an instrumental music instructor / teacher or privately. Of the 24 Local Authorities that charge for instrumental music tuition, most waive charges for such tuition when that tuition is part of the SQA exam presentation. It should be noted that charging for school tuition for gaining a qualification does not occur in any other curriculum subject area and the Group received considerable representations on this important issue.

As part of the Improvement Service research Local Authorities provided evidence about the charges they collect for instrumental music tuition from pupils studying for an SQA exam. When the Group met for the first time on 31 January, 5 Local Authorities charged pupils for instrumental music tuition associated with their SQA exams²⁰. By the time of the final meeting on 23 May it was understood that they were all considering their position on this practice.

In light of the above, the Group makes the following Recommendation:-

Recommendation 5

The majority of Councils charge for the provision of Instrumental music tuition and a small number charge for instrumental music provision relating to learners' SQA course work in music examinations. The Group acknowledges that decisions on charging for services sits with Local Authorities and further appreciates the financial pressures on Authorities, especially at this time. The Group notes that when it met for the first time, 5 Local Authorities charged for instrumental music tuition associated with SQA exams and wholeheartedly welcomes the recent decisions by all 5 Authorities to either rescind such charges or review them with the aim of ceasing the charge.

²⁰ This charging is associated with a pupil's first instrument. From the Improvement Service's research it emerged late in the Group's work that some Authorities charge for instrumental tuition for a pupil's second instrument. There is still some work to be carried out on this issue although the numbers involved so far appear to be very insignificant, and indeed many Local Authorities do not offer a second instrument.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Section 3. Collaboration on and benefits to instrumental music with other Local Authorities, Community Groups, YMI and the more effective use of musical instruments

There are many providers of musical experiences for children and young people, starting from early exposure to singing and percussion instruments at home and in toddler groups and continuing in pre-school settings. Primary school is probably the first time when many children are exposed to instrumental music and many older Primary children learn to play the recorder.

The Group found that in delivering instrumental music services, Local Authorities tend to rely on and use their own staff, instruments and repairers and do not tend share such resources with other Authorities. This is possibly due to a lack of knowledge about neighboring Authorities' resources. However the current audit of Local Authorities' instrument assets being undertaken by the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland²¹ and the Improvement Service's survey of staff numbers and discipline provides much potential for collaboration in future.

Instrumental music opportunities for young people are not only provided in a formal school setting. There are many community groups and bands that provide opportunities for young musicians, typically of secondary school age. There appears to be variable collaboration between Local Authorities and community groups. Whilst some instrumental music service managers know and liaise with local community groups and bands, other Local Authorities appeared to have little knowledge of or collaboration with, such groups and vice versa.

Some Local Authorities deliver their YMI opportunities through the education department; others use a different service such as culture or arts. The mixed delivery of YMI and the opportunities provided by the YMI were not readily understood by some parents and community groups.

In light of these varying practices, the Group feels there are opportunities to improve instrumental music experiences and learning arising from greater collaboration between Local Authorities themselves and Community Groups.

These issues highlight the lack of information available to parents and young people who are interested in, or would like to benefit from an instrumental music experience. This could be addressed through some targeted work to provide and maintain a list of opportunities.

In addition to the joint working opportunities above, the Group noted that there was varied but generally modest arrangements by Local Authorities for sponsorship by and partnership with the private and voluntary sectors. Given the challenging financial climate the Group found this disappointing and felt that more could be done.

There are also opportunities for collaborating to secure economies associated with access to and the use of printed sheet music in light of copyright issues. The Schools Printed Music Licence offers terms and peace of mind for schools that wish

²¹ <http://www.rcs.ac.uk/> - The RCS is Scotland's only Conservatoire and a crucible for creativity in performance and production

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

to make full use of their printed music without having to clear permissions from the music publishers for each use, allowing for a single payment for ease of budgeting rather than the uncertainty of the pay-as-you-use method and the assurance of blanket coverage rather than the worry of risk of infringement. Collaborating nationally for all Scottish schools could result in significant savings for the sector.

Local Authorities own and provide instruments in many different ways. The Group noted that the audit being carried out by the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland of instruments across the country provides an excellent platform for future repair, maintenance and purchase policies of instruments, consistent with teaching provision and expertise.

The Scottish Government has announced the provision of a £1 million Musical Instrument Fund, to be administered by the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland to enable Local Authorities to purchase or repair instruments for use by children. The Conservatoire in consultation with local authorities oversees the allocation of funding and whilst supporting the development of instrumental music services across the country, will ensure that the main beneficiaries are young people in disadvantaged areas. As part of the exercise, authorities have been asked to provide an inventory of their current stock of instruments. This data offers the opportunity to assess the geographical availability of instruments but also the dispersed nature of different types of instrument. It has also highlighted that many authorities have a number of instruments that simply need to be repaired.

In light of the above, the Group makes the following Recommendations:-

Recommendation 6

In providing instrumental music services in a challenging financial climate, Local Authorities should consider options for economies of scale. The Group noted the varied practice in Authorities' collaboration with Community groups, other Local Authorities and with National music bodies. The Group recommends that Local Authorities should investigate the options for better collaboration with other Instrumental music services and Community Groups in the provision, purchase, repair and sharing of instruments and in the delivery of instrumental music tuition.

Recommendation 7

Local Authorities own and provide instruments in many different ways. The Group noted that the audit being carried out by the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland of instruments across the country provides an excellent platform for future repair, maintenance and purchase policies of instruments, consistent with teaching provision and expertise. The Group recommends that Local Authorities use the information from this overview to derive the maximum use, economic efficiency and sustainability from these assets, including maintaining the inventory and ensuring timely repairs. Consideration should also be given to following this up with a baseline study identifying supply chain issues and markets for repair and purchase of instruments which could be addressed by an instrument apprenticeship scheme.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendation 8

The Group noted the different awareness and knowledge of instrumental music activities and opportunities across the country. To provide more consistency and better information for communities the Group suggests that consideration is given to the development and maintenance of a comprehensive user guide of instrumental music opportunities in Scotland.

Recommendation 9

The Group noted the varied but generally modest arrangements by Local Authorities for sponsorship by and partnership with the private and voluntary sectors. The Group recommends a far more pro-active approach should be taken by Local Authorities to seek external sponsorship for instrumental music provision, including at a regional or national level, to bring in support and extend opportunities for learners.

Recommendation 10

The Youth Music initiative (YMI) has been very successful in providing opportunities for young people across Scotland and its success has generated increased demand on local authority instrumental music services for progression opportunities after the initial YMI experience. The Group noted that there is a need at a local level for clarity in the demarcation between the YMI and Instrumental Music Services in schools. The group recommends that the National Vision Statement (in Recommendation 1) should take into account the remit and role of the YMI and other local youth music provision.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Section 4. New technologies

The Group noted that providing quality instrumental music tuition in remote parts of the country is expensive and can be limited. The Group were aware that there are some exciting developments afoot in this area, with, amongst others, the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland providing masterclass lessons to schools in Dumfries and Galloway through high quality video-conferencing²² and Napier University arranging remote accompanists for wind instrumentalists through video conferencing. Western Isles Council's (Comhairle nan Eilean Siar) instrumental music service are also currently revising new delivery methods for music tuition, by innovative use of ICT, e-learning and video conferencing. This will improve efficiency of resources, and make better use of specialist instruction. While mindful of how essential face-to-face teaching of an instrument is to the development of a young person's musicianship skills, the Group felt that more can and should be done to examine the potential of on-line instrumental music tuition.

In light of the above, the Group makes the following Recommendation:-

Recommendation 11

The Group noted that delivering instrumental music tuition in remote parts of the country and providing opportunities to learn from top professional musicians is challenging. Consistent with the collaboration agenda, Local Authorities should complement individual and group instrumental music tuition and explore the huge opportunities arising from the use of technology to enhance the delivery of a 21st Century instrumental music service.

²² A successful pilot scheme has been held involving the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland and Dumfries and Galloway Council where a brass tutor working from a base in the Royal Conservatoire provides weekly masterclass lessons to pupils in remote primary schools in that area through high quality video-conferencing.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Section 5. Instrumental music tuition Workforce

In terms of professional development of those involved with instrumental music services particularly regarding the status of the instrumental music tutors and educators in schools, there are a number of issues which may affect the delivery of the service and fairness towards the staff and pupils which require greater investigation. The Group is aware of on-going discussions between various bodies about instrumental music staff.

In light of the above, the Group makes the following Recommendation:-

Recommendation 12

The Group identified several workforce development and planning issues for instrumental music staff including continuing professional development. The Group also notes the aspirations of staff to gain greater professional recognition. Such recognition would be consistent with the provision of a highly valued and professional instrumental music service.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Section 6. Future work

As above, the Group notes the very significant benefits instrumental music learning provides for young people and society as a whole. However little is known about its wider impacts. The Group is grateful to the Improvement Service for its comprehensive research into instrumental music services as evidence for this report. In particular a huge wealth of information has been gathered on the instrumental music tuition services but due to the limited time available there will inevitably be some gaps in the data. However the information gathered, coupled with the survey of Local Authorities' instrument resources now collated by the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland allows for the first time, a strong picture to be gained of instrumental music learning and teaching across the country. It is important that this excellent overview is not lost and therefore the Group suggests that steps must be taken to maintain this information.

The last Guidance for Instrumental Music Tuition in Schools²³ was produced in 2003 and needs updating, not only in relation to curriculum developments since then – notably Curriculum for Excellence – but also in light of this report.

During the five meetings of the Group it became increasingly evident that the considerable benefits of instrumental music learning is not fully appreciated or realised and that steps should be taken to address this. This materialised in two distinct developments at the last meeting in May. Firstly the Association of Directors of Education in Scotland (ADES) offered to sponsor a National Conference of the benefits arising from instrumental music tuition. Secondly Education Scotland stated that it would bring in a new requirement to its inspection findings for a statement commenting on the quality of Instrumental music tuition for every school from September 2013.

The Group has, perhaps inevitably, found that there has been a necessary limitation to what it can achieve given the relatively short timescale of its work (less than five months from the first meeting to submission of this report). It has therefore focused on the key issues around provision and charging. However there have been several other areas of work it feels it should address in delivering fully on its remit. Given the time constraints, the Group therefore suggests that a follow-up implementation group should be established to oversee future developments (as outlined above) and to maintain the excellent collaborative atmosphere and approach that the Group has enjoyed during the last 5 months. Local Authorities will be an important part of the delivery of the Recommendations and the implementation group will need to ensure that a collaborative approach is taken. This will ensure that the National Vision, benchmarking framework, research and an inclusive National Conference and other related initiatives will keep up the positive momentum following the Group's work to the benefit of all stakeholders and young people involved in instrumental music tuition.

²³ <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/47034/0023903.pdf>

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

In light of the above, the Group makes the following Recommendations:-

Recommendation 13

The Group recognises the very significant benefits instrumental music learning provides for young people and society as a whole. However little is known about its wider impacts. Accordingly the Group recommends that specific research is carried out to examine the contribution of instrumental music learning to Scotland's economic and cultural capital in an international context and also to children's learning and development.

Recommendation 14

The Group is grateful to the Improvement Service for its comprehensive research into instrumental music services as evidence for this report. The Group welcomes the Improvement Service's offer to create, maintain and provide a standard benchmarking framework to capture in a standard form data on charging policy, current charges, participation and drop-out rates for instrumental music services across Scotland and recommends that, once established, this data should be monitored continuously by service providers.

Recommendation 15

The Group recommends that the current Heads of Instrumental Teaching Scotland (HITS) guidance – 'Guidelines For Instrumental Teaching In Scottish Schools - 2003' be updated in partnership with Scottish Government; Education Scotland; COSLA; and the EIS, to bring it in line with Curriculum for Excellence.

Recommendation 16

The Group applauds:-

- a. the offer by ADES to sponsor a National Conference on Instrumental Music to promote a better understanding of the benefits to young people and society arising from Instrumental Music tuition, and
- b. the intention by Education Scotland to ensure that a statement commenting on the quality of Instrumental music tuition will be added to the list of obligatory statements in the Report of Inspection Findings for every school from September 2013.

Recommendation 17

The Group recommends that the Scottish Government sets up an Instrumental Music Implementation Group (IMIG) to oversee the strategic progression of these recommendations, support new guidance (recommendation 15) and report back to Ministers by December 2014.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

COMPLETE LIST OF RECOMMENDATIONS

PREAMBLE

The 32 Local Authorities in Scotland have chosen many different ways to deliver instrumental music tuition in their area taking account of the many variations in musical traditions, cultures, demography and incomes. Some Local Authorities provide this free to participating young people whilst others have introduced charges and reinvest the income in supporting instrumental music tuition provision. Members of the Group acknowledge that charging for this discretionary service in the current economic circumstances is perhaps inevitable. However several members aspire for a situation where instrumental music tuition services are provided free to all participants across the country.

In order to gain a better understanding of instrumental music services across the country, the Improvement Service carried out comprehensive research into the policies and delivery of instrumental music provision by every Local Authority.

From the Improvement Service research the Group recognises that:

- a) When the Group's first met in January some 24 Local Authorities charged for the provision of instrumental music tuition with 5 of those charging for instrumental music tuition associated with an SQA exam.
- b) Local Authorities do not make a profit from the charges they apply for instrumental music tuition. Those that do charge reinvest the income into supporting and further developing provision of their instrumental music service.
- c) There does not appear to be any systematic relationship between charging and the take-up of instrumental music tuition in Local Authorities.

Bearing this in mind and taking other evidence obtained into account, the Group hereby recommends that:-

1. Music Education, including the distinctive part played by Instrumental Music Tuition, would benefit from a National Vision Statement. This should be the subject of a collective approach linking formal and informal providers and which highlights the wider benefits of young people's participation in, and the learning of a musical instrument, including singing.

2. The provision of instrumental music services by all Local Authorities is unique highly valued and helps deliver Curriculum for Excellence. The Group recommends that Local Authorities should continue to deliver this service, notwithstanding the current financial challenges.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

3. There should be a general principle that pupils' individual circumstances should not be a barrier to their ability to access and benefit from instrumental music tuition. Local Authorities should review their charging policies and concessionary schemes to ensure that pupils in their area are not prevented from learning a musical instrument because of their background, location, disability or financial circumstances. Local Authorities should be willing to share good practice on availability, access to and the transparency of their concession and charging policies including consultation on these matters.

4. Further to Recommendation 3, the Group noted the limited and variable provision of instrumental music tuition available for pupils with additional support needs as well as the huge value and life-changing impact that learning to play a musical instrument can provide. The Group recommends that Local Authorities share best practice in their delivery of instrumental music tuition to all children and young people equally, including approaches to specialist training and continuing professional development for Instrumental staff to broaden out and extend provision, particularly to children with additional support needs.

5. The majority of Councils charge for the provision of Instrumental music tuition and a small number charge for instrumental music provision relating to learners' SQA course work in music examinations. The Group acknowledges that decisions on charging for services sits with Local Authorities and further appreciates the financial pressures on Authorities, especially at this time. The Group notes that when it met for the first time, 5 Local Authorities charged for instrumental music tuition associated with SQA exams and wholeheartedly welcomes the recent decisions by all 5 Authorities to either rescind such charges or review them with the aim of ceasing the charge.

6. In providing instrumental music services in a challenging financial climate, Local Authorities should consider options for economies of scale. The Group noted the varied practice in Authorities' collaboration with Community groups, other Local Authorities and with National music bodies. The Group recommends that Local Authorities should investigate the options for better collaboration with other Instrumental music services and Community Groups in the provision, purchase, repair and sharing of instruments and in the delivery of instrumental music tuition.

7. Local Authorities own and provide instruments in many different ways. The Group noted that the audit being carried out by the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland of instruments across the country provides an excellent platform for future repair, maintenance and purchase policies of instruments, consistent with teaching provision and expertise. The Group recommends that Local Authorities use the information from this overview to derive the maximum use, economic efficiency and sustainability from these assets, including maintaining the inventory and ensuring timely repairs. Consideration should also be given to following this up with a baseline study identifying supply chain issues and markets for repair and purchase of instruments which could be addressed by an instrument apprenticeship scheme.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

8. The Group noted the different awareness and knowledge of instrumental music activities and opportunities across the country. To provide more consistency and better information for communities the Group suggests that consideration is given to the development and maintenance of a comprehensive user guide of instrumental music opportunities in Scotland.

9. The Group noted the varied but generally modest arrangements by Local Authorities for sponsorship by and partnership with the private and voluntary sectors. The Group recommends a far more pro-active approach should be taken by Local Authorities to seek external sponsorship for instrumental music provision, including at a regional or national level, to bring in support and extend opportunities for learners.

10 The Youth Music initiative (YMI) has been very successful in providing opportunities for young people across Scotland and its success has generated increased demand on local authority instrumental music services for progression opportunities after the initial YMI experience. The Group noted that there is a need at a local level for clarity in the demarcation between the YMI and Instrumental Music Services in schools. The group recommends that the National Vision Statement (in Recommendation 1) should take into account the remit and role of the YMI and other local youth music provision.

11. The Group noted that delivering instrumental music tuition in remote parts of the country and providing opportunities to learn from top professional musicians is challenging. Consistent with the collaboration agenda, Local Authorities should complement individual and group instrumental music tuition and explore the huge opportunities arising from the use of technology to enhance the delivery of a 21st Century instrumental music service.

12 The Group identified several workforce development and planning issues for instrumental music staff including continuing professional development. The Group also notes the aspirations of staff to gain greater professional recognition. Such recognition would be consistent with the provision of a highly valued and professional instrumental music service.

13 The Group recognises the very significant benefits instrumental music learning provides for young people and society as a whole. However little is known about its wider impacts. Accordingly the Group recommends that specific research is carried out to examine the contribution of instrumental music learning to Scotland's economic and cultural capital in an international context and also to children's learning and development.

14 The Group is grateful to the Improvement Service for its comprehensive research into instrumental music services as evidence for this report. The Group welcomes the Improvement Service's offer to create, maintain and provide a standard benchmarking framework to capture in a standard form data on charging policy, current charges, participation and drop-out rates for instrumental music services across Scotland and recommends that, once established, this data should be monitored continuously by service providers.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

15 The Group recommends that the current Heads of Instrumental Teaching Scotland (HITS) guidance – ‘Guidelines For Instrumental Teaching In Scottish Schools - 2003’ be updated in partnership with Scottish Government; Education Scotland; COSLA; and the EIS, to bring it in line with Curriculum for Excellence.

16 The Group applauds:-

- a) the offer by ADES to sponsor a National Conference on Music Education, including the distinctive part played by Instrumental Music to promote a better understanding of the benefits to young people and society arising from Instrumental Music tuition, and
- b) the intention by Education Scotland to ensure that a statement commenting on the quality of Instrumental music tuition will be added to the list of obligatory statements in the Report of Inspection Findings for every school from September 2013.

17 The Group recommends that the Scottish Government sets up an Instrumental Music Implementation Group (IMIG) to oversee the strategic progression of these recommendations, support new guidance (recommendation 15) and report back to Ministers by December 2014.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

ANNEX A

MEMBERSHIP OF THE INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP

David Green OBE, Chairperson

David is the former Independent Convenor of Highland Council; Former chair of Cairngorms National Park Authority and Crofters Commission; Member of The Scotland Committee of The Big Lottery Fund; non-executive director of SAC Commercial Ltd and a self-employed crofter.

John Stodter Association of Directors of Education in Scotland (ADES)

John is a former Director of Education and the General Secretary of ADES - the independent professional network for leaders and managers in education and children's services in Scotland.

John Urquhart Convention of Scottish Local Authorities (CoSLA)

John is a Policy Officer in the Education, Children and Young Peoples Team at COSLA.

Aileen Monaghan Education Scotland, Her Majesty's Inspector (HMI)

Aileen manages inspections in primary and secondary schools around the country and is the Subject Specialist Inspector for music and Lead officer for Transformative Change.

David McDonald Creative Scotland (CS)

David is the Youth Arts Manager at Creative Scotland and has over 20 years' experience of working in the cultural sector as a project manager, a local authority arts development officer; lecturer; workshop facilitator; and arts practitioner.

Paul Wood Heads of Instrumental Teaching Scotland (HITS)

Paul is the Instrumental Music Service Manager for East Ayrshire Council and Chair of Head of Instrumental Teacher Scotland (HITS). HITS represents Music Service Managers across Scotland providing training and support for its members.

Mae Murray Scottish Association for Music Education (SAME)

Mae is Principal Teacher of Music and Drama, Garnock Academy. SAME is the professional association representing all involved in music education, including Nursery and Primary teachers and specialists, Secondary teachers, instrumental tutors, Additional Support teachers and staff in Authorities with responsibility for music.

Mark Traynor, Educational Institute of Scotland (EIS)

Mark is Convenor of the Educational Institute of Scotland (EIS) Instrumental Music Teachers' Network which has the specific aim of promoting, developing and defining the vision of instrumental music in Scotland. As an instrumental teacher, he has been teaching and working in music education for over 20 years and passionately believes that instrumental music has an important role to play in Scottish Education.

Professor John Wallace CBE, Royal Conservatoire of Scotland (RCS)

John was formerly a professional musician and instrumental teacher and is now Principal of the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland, a performing and production arts education organisation which supplies much of the workforce for Scotland's creative and cultural performing industries across, music, dance, drama, production and screen, including its teaching workforce in performing arts education.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Douglas Chappelle National Parent Forum Scotland (NPFS)

Douglas represents the parents of East Dunbartonshire on the National Parent Forum of Scotland. The National Parent Forum of Scotland gives Parent Councils and Parents an opportunity to discuss and raise educational issues of mutual interest or concerns at a national level.

Morag Campbell National Youth Choir of Scotland (NYCoS)

Morag is the Chief Executive of NYCoS which is dedicated to encouraging singing for young people aged 0-24. Established in 1996 with a single choir the organisation has grown to include four National Choirs, a growing network of Area Choirs, Mini Music Maker classes and a broad range of educational projects.

Joan Gibson National Youth Orchestra of Scotland (NYOS)

Joan is Chief Executive of NYOS, a registered Scottish charity founded in 1979 and committed to the development of youth music education in Scotland. NYOS provides a comprehensive portfolio of high quality musical education opportunities in classical, jazz, contemporary classical and cross-genre music through eight ensembles for young people aged 8- 25 years.

Darren Henley, OBE Classic FM,

Darren is Managing Director of Global Radio's UK-wide classical music station, Classic FM. He has advised successive Westminster governments on music and cultural education and has written more than twenty books about classical music and musicians.

Scottish Government Secretariat;

Tim Simons Head of Curriculum Unit, Learning Directorate.
Sue Langlands Head of Expressive Arts Team, Curriculum Unit.
Kate McKechnie Policy Officer, Expressive Arts Team, Curriculum Unit.

The following also attended more than one meeting of the Group:-

Bruce Robertson, OBE Association of Directors of Education in Scotland (ADES)
Bruce is a former Director of Education and ADES advisor to the Scottish Government.

Hannah Derbyshire Improvement Service (IS)
Hannah is a Graduate Research Assistant at the Improvement Service

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

ANNEX B

YOUTH MUSIC INITIATIVE (YMI)

The YMI was established in 2003 to put music at the heart of young people's lives and learning. Since its establishment the YMI has been managed by the Scottish Arts Council then Creative Scotland and the Government has invested a total of £87.5 million over 10 years. The YMI currently operates with an annual budget of £10 million and supports over 300 projects a year covering all musical genres, age groups and teaching methods. Creative Scotland sees its role for the YMI not solely a distributor of Government funds but as an Agency that plays an important role in helping the youth music sector ensure all voices within it are heard. The YMI has two distinct strands:-

(1) **School Based Music Making** provides activities planned and delivered by Local Authority education services; this accounts for some 80% of the overall budget (£8 million per annum). This formal sector funding is primarily aimed at addressing the Government's target 'by 2006, every school pupil in Scotland should be offered a year of free music tuition by the time they reach primary six' (this target was met and is being sustained). Investment is distributed based on a Government formula which takes account of a number of factors including number of pupils, geographical collation and social deprivation. The investment supports musical activities and opportunities to young people over and above what the Local Authority already supports through its Instrumental Music Service provision. No fees or charges are levied for participation and participation has enabled a generation of school pupils to experience the joys and pleasures of learning an instrument and to read music. There are suggestions that it has provided an upsurge in demand for further instrumental music learning. Through YMI funding 24 local authorities have established external partnerships with local and national providers such as Drake Music Scotland, Fèis Rois and the National Youth Choir of Scotland to offer new, diverse and accessible music tuition.

(2) **The Informal Sector** – activities planned and delivered by third sector organisations outwith school time; this strand accounts for approximately 20% of the budget (£2 million per annum). Through its informal sector the YMI has supported 379 projects to date creating new music making opportunities that happen outside of school time.

The wide range of opportunities supported by the YMI both in and outside of school has resulted in a sea change in the number of young people regularly participating in music making. Singing and brass playing are two particular success stories which have seen the number of children participating significantly increase as a result of YMI. This is highlighted through the resurgence that has been seen in the brass band movement in Scotland, 45 youth brass bands (an increase of 500% in 5 years), totalling over 1400 young people performed at the 2012 National Festival.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

ANNEX C

LIST OF INFORMAL MEETINGS, CONSULTEES, AND OTHER EVIDENCE.

Informal meetings were held between the Chairman, Scottish Government Secretariat and the following organisations to gather background information about instrumental music tuition and community music provision. These meetings were as follows:-

25 February	Aberdeen and Aberdeenshire Community Music Groups (Aberdeen City Music School; Bon-Accord Silver Band; Friends of Aberdeen Instrumental Music; Aberdeen Performing Arts; Grampian Youth Orchestra);
26 February	Aberdeen City Council; Aberdeenshire Council;
20 March	Glasgow and West of Scotland Community Music Groups (Scottish Brass Bands Association; Fife Brass Band Association; East Renfrewshire Schools Pipe Band); Scottish Youth Parliament;
21 March	Glasgow City Council; East Renfrewshire Council; Renfrewshire Council;
24 April	Highland Council; Moray Council;
23 May	Perth and Kinross Council, Dundee City Council; Stirling Council

In the gathering of evidence for the report, the Chairman and /or Secretariat also discussed – through informal meetings and telephone discussions - the provision of instrumental music tuition with the following bodies and individuals:-

Informal meetings took place with:-

Iain Gray, MSP

Ms Nicola Killean, CEO, Sistema Scotland

Ms Thursa Sanderson, CEO, Drake Music

Ms Fiona Dalgety, CEO, Feis Rois

Martin Prchal, Vice Principal of the Royal Conservatoire in The Hague

Gill Davies, Digital Producer and MRes student at Edinburgh Napier

Telephone discussions took place with:-

Liz Smith, MSP

Neil Findlay, MSP

Liam McArthur, MSP

Mr John McLaughlin, Fife Council

Ms Jennifer Rimmer, former Principal, St Mary's School of Music

Mr Kenneth Taylor, Principal, St Mary's School of Music

Ms Jane Davidson, Director of Education, Scottish Opera

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The Group also invited comments and responses to an **Instrumental Music Tuition Narrative** produced to elicit background evidence. Comments were invited on:-

- who provides instrumental music tuition;
- what support is provided and from whom;
- the security of the support;
- what other support has been sought;
- what value is given by society to the work,
- aspirations for instrumental music tuition in the local area; and
- any other relevant information about instrumental music tuition.

The Group is grateful to the following individuals who responded to this narrative:-

Angela Doran	Leisure and Culture Dundee
Thursa Sanderson	Drake Music Scotland
David Francis	Traditional Music Forum
Roddy Macleod	The National Piping Centre
Sheena Macdonald	The Musicians' Union (MU)
Carol Main	Live Music Now Scotland
James Dean	Glasgow East Arts Company
Linda Lees	City of Edinburgh Council
Iain MacDonald	East Renfrewshire Schools Pipe Band
Gavin Kelly	Celtic Music Programme
John Purves	Music in West Kilbride
Tess Erginsoy	Friend's of Moray Music Centre
Liz Richardson	Campbeltown Brass Band
Anne Clarke	Irvine Folk Club and Marymass Folk Festival
Francis Cummings	Sistema Scotland
Doug Haig	The Haddington Bridge Centre / East Lothian Council Community Learning and Development Service
Arthur Cormack	Fèisean nan Gàidheal
Fiona Maclean	Morningside Youth Pipe Band
Una Phelan	Parent of Child in Edinburgh Pipe Band
Linda Campbell	Parent of child with additional support needs
Aileen McLaughlin	FEISARAINN
Robert McGuire	International Agency
Mike McGuire	Ardrossan Music Experience
Dougie Pincock	National Centre of Excellence in Traditional Music, Plockton
John McLaughlin	Fife Council
Andrew Duncan	Scottish Brass Bands Association

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

ANNEX D

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC SERVICE: SURVEY RESULTS: EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This research was initiated to provide up-to-date information on the provision of instrumental (including voice) music services across Scotland. Instrumental Music is a discretionary service provided by all Local Authorities and is additional to the music curriculum taught within the classroom. This study concentrates solely on these discretionary services, outwith YMI funded tuition and the music curriculum.

Instrumental Music Services vary substantially across Local Authorities in Scotland. Policies include variations in tuition costs, concession rates, selection procedures, available instruments and hire, and additional activities. This makes any comparison between these services very complex and requires several considerations to be made.

The cost of instrumental tuition across Scotland ranges from no cost to over £300 per year. Despite this difference, there is no detectable relationship between the variation of tuition costs across Scotland and the percentage of pupils taking up instrumental music. Cost, therefore, does not have a substantial impact on the overall pupil uptake across Local Authorities in Scotland, indicating that other determining factors are operating.

Five Local Authorities currently charge pupils sitting SQA music awards for instrumental music tuition. It is possible for pupils to sit SQA music without this additional tuition by taking instruments available in the classroom. Nonetheless, four of these five Local Authorities are officially removing these charges next academic session. Amongst Local Authorities that do not charge for SQA music pupils, it varies whether they begin free tuition in S3 or S4, and whether these pupils are able to take up one or two instruments (outwith the classroom). This indicates the complexity of charging structures across Scotland. Several Local Authorities choose to limit tuition to one instrument per pupil to offer opportunities to more pupils.

Several Local Authorities proceed with selection procedures to identify pupils with aptitude and pupils who will benefit from tuition. These selection procedures vary across and, in some cases, within Local Authorities. Many services proceed with some form of aptitude tests to select the most suitable pupils for the instrument concerned. Although some services try to accommodate all interested pupils, in many Local Authorities this is simply not possible as demand highly outweighs resources.

Several Local Authorities expressed a rationale for introducing or increasing charges in order to sustain and maintain their service under financial constraints. As various services are already unable to meet popular demand, cutting the service owing to financial constraints could have further implications on available spaces and opportunities. Furthermore, there is no systematic relationship between the variation of tuition costs and the percentage of the education budget dedicated to Instrumental Music. In this sense, Local Authorities charging relatively highly for tuition are not necessarily putting any less of their education budget towards the service. Revenue from tuition does not cover the total cost of the service for any Local Authority; the total combined revenue from the 24 charging Authorities amounts to 19% of the total

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

cost of these services. All instrumental music services are substantially subsidised by Local Government.

Furthermore, nearly all Local Authorities that charge for instrumental tuition have put in place some form of concession to protect equal access to the service, including exemptions or discounts to pupils from low-income households.

The fact there is no relationship between tuition costs and uptake percentages across Scotland, does not imply that introducing or increasing tuition costs does not have an impact on pupil numbers for an individual council. Several Heads of Instrumental Services expressed concern over the effect increasing charges has, especially for pupils just missing entitlement for concessions. A couple of Local Authorities have experienced a large or continuous decline in pupil numbers following an increase in charges. Nonetheless, these Authorities have reviewed their charging structure in response to this, and this decline is not a consistent occurrence. One Local Authority experienced a larger drop in pupil numbers following staff cuts than when they introduced charges. Therefore, changes in charging structures can influence pupil numbers, but so can staff cuts and other service reductions.

Although there are variations between Instrumental Music Policies; musical traditions and cultures also vary throughout Scotland, as do demography and income. A policy that is successful in one Local Authority would not necessarily be optimal for another. Popularity and demand vary between and within Local Authorities, therefore, requiring a local focus.

Overall, tuition costs are only one consideration regarding access to instrumental music tuition. Many other features such as range and number of instruments and instructors, and selection procedures also affect access to the service. No Local Authority in Scotland has a completely universal instrumental music service in the sense that any pupil can access tuition on any instrument. Nonetheless, there is no doubt about these services' commitment to provide the optimal service given the resources available. Several Instrumental Music Services are very active, offering a large number of extra activities including music centres, bands, orchestras, ensembles and residential courses.

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC GROUP REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

ANNEX E

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Instrumental and Vocal Teacher Education: European Perspectives (2007-2010)

Available at:

<http://aebsite.cramgo.nl/DownloadView.aspx?ses=22771>

Forgeard, Marie. Winner, Ellen. Norton, Andrea. Schlaug, Gottfried. (2008)
Practicing a Musical Instrument in Childhood is Associated with Enhanced Verbal Ability and Nonverbal Reasoning

Available at:

<http://www.plosone.org/article/info%3Adoi%2F10.1371%2Fjournal.pone.0003566>

Hallam, Susan (2009)

The Power of Music: Its impact on the intellectual, social and personal development of children and young people

Available at:

http://www.laphil.com/sites/default/files/media/pdfs/shared/education/yola/susan-hallam-music-development_research.pdf

Hallam, Susan and Creech, Andrea (2010)

Music Education in the 21st Century in the United Kingdom

Achievements, analysis and aspirations

Available at:

http://www.teachingmusic.org.uk/media/cms_new/teachingmusic_live/document/download.aspx?lngDocumentID=1373

Hallam, Susan (2011)

Case Study on the Impact of IOE research

Music Education

Available at:

http://www.ioe.ac.uk/Research_Expertise/IOE_RD_A4_ME_final_d.pdf

Hash, Phillip M. (2004)

Pullout Lessons in Instrumental Music Education

Available at:

<http://www.jstor.org/stable/40319203>

Jäncke, Lutz (2009)

Music Drives Brain Plasticity

Available at:

<http://f1000.com/Reports/Biology/content/1/78>